Law Reform in Ireland. An Overview

James Kneale*  
[1st January 2019]

1. Background and development of law reform bodies and processes in Ireland

Law reform as a distinct programme with consistent approach in Ireland first emerged in 1962 with the introduction of a White Paper setting out a Programme of Law Reform and the establishment for the first time of a specific division in the Department of Justice with responsibility for reform1. Up to this point, law reform in Ireland had been aimed at adapting pre-independence legislation to the post-independence era and, subsequently, the introduction of legislation reflective of Irish mores2.

The 1962 Programme had ambitious aims, providing for, according to the then Minister for Justice Charles Haughey, a «complete overhaul of civil law, criminal law, court practice and procedure and of other legislation for which the Minister for Justice is responsible», including the codification of certain branches of law3. The programme saw considerable success during the first few years after its introduction with the enactment of important reforming legislation such as the Guardianship of Infants Act 1964 and the Succession Act 1965, but by 1966 its impetus was slowing, particularly due to the stress placed on the limited resources of the Irish civil service relating to its accession to the then EEC4.

New impetus for law reform arose with the passing of the Law Reform Commission Act, 1975. The 1975 Act, inspired by the establishment in 1967 of the Law Commission for England and Wales and the Scottish Law Commission, established the Law Reform Commission. The Law Reform Commission comprises five persons: Its president (typically a High Court or Supreme Court judge), and four Commissioners (who must be serving or retired judges, barristers, solicitors, teachers of law, or other suitably qualified persons).

Under the 1975 Act, the Commission’s tasks are «widely stated»5; it «shall keep the law under review and in accordance with the provisions of this Act shall undertake examinations and conduct research with a view to reforming the law and formulate proposals for law reform». Law reform is defined in the Act as the development of the law, its codification (including its simplification and modernization), and the revision and consolidation of statute law.

Topics of work for the Commission come from its general programme of work, which is prepared in consultation with the Attorney General for submission by the Taoiseach (Prime Minister) for government

---

* BCL Law and French, University College Cork, Ireland, LL.M, College of Europe, Bruges, Belgium. I am grateful for the helpful comments and corrections of Edward Donelan.
1 Although the Programme did not include the establishment of a permanent law reform committee or agency. For background, see address of Charles J. Haughey, then Minister for Justice: C. J. Haughey, ‘Law Reform in Ireland’, The International and Comparative Law Quarterly, Vol. 13, No. 4, 1964, pp. 1300-1315.
approval (Currently: the Fourth Programme of Law Reform6), or from requests or references from the Attorney General. Usually, the Commission drafts consultation papers and draft reports, on the basis of topics identified in its Programme of Law Reform. Following a process of consultation, the Commission publishes its reports containing its formal recommendations7.

Following the publication of the Commission’s formal recommendations, it is for the Oireachtas (Parliament), as the sole body vested with legislative power under the Irish Constitution, to act upon them8. While in the early years of the Law Reform Commission, the government was frequently criticised for not implementing its recommendations (due, perhaps, to the relatively controversial subject areas and radical proposals made by the Commission, such as the Commission’s recommendations on illegitimacy of children)9, in recent times roughly 70% of the Commission’s recommendations are implemented10.

In addition to the Law Reform Commission, a number of other bodies have, or have had, responsibility for elements of law reform in Ireland. Notably, in 1998, the Government established a Statute Law Revision and Consolidation Unit in the Office of the Attorney General, with a mandate to draft statute law reform and consolidation bills. Similarly, the Criminal Law Codification Advisory Committee, a statutory body established under the Criminal Justice Act 2006, is responsible for overseeing the development of a programme for the codification of the criminal law11.

2. Introduction to the available literature

The vast majority of the surveyed literature limits itself to surveying recent developments in law reform from a practical perspective, with practitioners and officials representing the majority of authors on the topic. Law reform has not yet been the subject of substantial academic analysis in Ireland. Nevertheless, the perspectives offered by practitioners and those directly involved in law reform processes are valuable.

2.1. Statute law revision

When the Irish State was founded in 1922, it inherited a considerable amount of pre-independence legislation. Between 1870 and 1920, a comprehensive collection of all Public General Acts (the largest category of legislation, as opposed to Local and Personal, or Private, acts), in their amended form, was published under the name of Statutes Revised. In parallel, all acts of the pre-1800 Irish Parliament were collected in the publication Irish Statutes Revised, published in 1885. As a result, when the Irish State was established, a relatively clear and comprehensive collection of almost all legislation in force was inherited by the new state12.

---

8 Article 15.2.1 of the Constitution of Ireland (Bunreacht na hEireann) provides that «The sole and exclusive power of making laws for the State is hereby vested in the Oireachtas [Parliament]: no other legislative authority has power to make laws for the State». Strictly speaking, therefore, law reform in Ireland is exclusively a matter for the Parliament.
11 <http://criminalcode.ie/>.

IALS Law Reform Project – A LITERATURE REVIEW

As Jonathan Teasdale notes, statute law revision in Ireland was originally motivated by the political imperative of throwing off the «yoke of former imperial power» and revising the statute book so as to remove obsolete and unnecessary statutes enacted pre-independence. More recently, statute law reform has been considered to form part of an agenda of modernisation and better regulation13.

Edward Donelan, former Director of the Statute Law Revision Unit in the Office of the Attorney General sets out in a number of contributions the background to, and processes for, the programme of statute law revision which has been underway in Ireland in recent years14. Donelan defines statute law revision broadly as «the process whereby spent Acts are repealed by the Oireachtas or brought up to date by modernising their wording»15. In this sense, statute law revision includes “pure consolidation”, whereby repealed words are cut from a text, amended text is replaces or new material is inserted; revision in the sense of tidying-up and modernising the language of a statute, and amending or repealing a statute so as to achieve a modified policy objective16. The office with responsibility for statute law revision, the Statute Law Revision and Consolidation unit in the Office of the Attorney General, thus had a similarly broad mandate, to «draft statute law reform and consolidation bills and related work» (although this mandate does not extend to codification, which is considered a more ambitious task).

The Statute Law Revision Unit was established in the Office of the Attorney General in 1998, with two objectives: to review all legislation in force since 1215 and to make recommendations for reform, and to draft informal consolidations called restatements. The political impetus behind the present statute law revision programme stemmed from the need for regulatory reform, cutting "red tape" and the improvement of efficiency through de-regulation – set out in the publication in July 1999 of the government programme Reducing Red Tape – An Action Programme of Regulatory Reform in Ireland17. Shortly after, in 2001, the OECD published a report entitled Regulatory Reform in Ireland, which emphasised the link between economic growth and regulatory reform, and in 2004, the Government published a White Paper setting out principles of better regulation and proposed a programme, under the remit of the Statute Law Revision Unit, to be put in place in order to analyse and review pre-1922 legislation18.

The programme for statute law revision saw (and continues to see) a number of successes including the Statute Law Revision (Pre-1922) Act, 2005, the Statute Law Revision Acts of 2007, 2009, 2012, 2015 and 2016. These acts expressly or impliedly repealed a considerable number of pre and post-independence statutes, as well as secondary legislation and local, personal and private acts. Interestingly, the 2007 Act adopted a new approach for statute law revision in this jurisdiction by introducing a “white list” of specific pre-independence statutes which should be retained, expressly or impliedly repealing all others19.

19 See, for an overview of these acts, R. Humphreys, ‘Clearing the Statute Book’, The Bar Review, Vol. 21, No. 6, 2016, p. 177. It should also be noted that these recent acts are not the only Statute Law Revision acts in Ireland. Prior to independence, two Statute Law Revision Acts were enacted (in 1878 and 1879) as well as four post-independence acts (the Fisheries (Statute Law Revision) Acts 1949 and 1956, the Statute Law Revision (Pre-Union Irish Statutes) Act 1962 and the Statute Law Revision Act 1983. Of considerable usefulness in respect of these developments are the annual reviews of legislation published by
IALS Law Reform Project – A LITERATURE REVIEW

The activities of the Statute Law Revision Unit were transferred to the Law Reform Commission following the departure of the Unit’s Director, Edward Donelan, in 2004. The Statute Law Revision Project is currently being examined by the Law Reform Commission under its Fourth Programme of Law Reform. The website of the Law Reform Commission maintains revised versions of all amended post-2006 revised Acts and a substantial number of pre-2006 revised Acts.

2.2. Restatement

The Statute Law (Restatement) Act, 2002, adopted as part of the Government’s better regulation initiative, confers on the Attorney General the power to authorise the making available of updated versions of Acts of the Oireachtas, in the form of a single text certified by the Attorney General «to be a statement of the law contained in the provisions of the statutes to which it relates». These texts shall be known as restatements. After certification by the Attorney General, restatements must be laid before the Oireachtas, and can be published 21 days later. Restatements differ from consolidated Acts as they do not have the force of law; however, a restatement, according to section 5(1) of the 2002 Act, «shall be prima facie evidence of the law contained in the provisions to which it relates of any statute or statutory instrument». Moreover, restatements «shall be judicially noticed» (Section 5(2)). Hunt notes that this Act was based on the procedures in place in New South Wales and Queensland.

In 2006, the responsibility for restatements was taken away from the Office of the Attorney General (at the request of the Attorney General) and conferred instead on the Law Reform Commission.

Prior to this, the Statute Law Revision Unit of the Office of the Attorney General had responsibility for preparing restatements. However, in accordance with the 2002 Act, the Attorney General continues to certify restatements. In 2007, the Law Reform Commission published a consultation paper on statute law restatement, along with various draft restatements and in 2008 it published a Report on statute law restatement.

2.3. Consolidation and codification

As above, but making further changes to the law, both in terms of form and substance.

The Programme of Law Reform set out by the 1962 White Paper, mentioned above, included various attempts at codification and consolidation. At the time of the publication of the White Paper, Charles Haughey, then Minister for Justice, spoke in favour of codifying branches of law, as the opportunity arises, so that all of the law on a particular subject would be fully and clearly stated in one enactment. The Programme included a number of significant consolidations, such as the Succession Act, 1965 and the


Available at: <http://www.lawreform.ie/_fileupload/consultation%20papers/Restatement%20CP.pdf>.

Available at: <http://www.lawreform.ie/_fileupload/consultation%20papers/Appendixes%20Restatement.pdf>.


IALS Law Reform Project – A LITERATURE REVIEW

Guardianship of Infants Act, 1964. In 1974, following the establishment of the Law Reform Commission, the Government announced that it hoped that the work of the Commission would result, in the long term, in a complete codification of the law\(^{27}\).

Under the Standing Orders of the Oireachtas (Parliament), a fast-track procedure exists for the adoption of pure consolidation Bills. Under this procedure, the Attorney General certifies that a consolidation Bill does not make any material change to the law. Where there is a need to make substantive changes before consolidation, a consolidation Bill may be preceded by a Bill effecting any necessary amendments, which may then be incorporated into the fast-track procedure through Parliament\(^{28}\). Consolidation has, however, so far only been implemented as individual projects, such as the adoption of the Companies Act 2014, the Land and Conveyancing Law Reform Act, 2009 and the Taxes Consolidation Act, 1997. These Acts have included consolidation of statute law and codification of the common law.

One significant example of an organised process of codification in Ireland was the establishment of the Expert Group on Codification in 2003, which recommended a codification of the criminal law, following which a Criminal Law Codification Advisory Committee\(^{29}\) was established in 2007, under the Criminal Justice Act 2006. In 2010, the Criminal Law Advisory Committee published a draft Criminal Code and Commentary; however, this draft has not been acted upon\(^{30}\).

The Law Reform Commission has stated that an ultimate objective should be the «eventual consolidation of all legislation with a view to achieving the principle of one Act per subject and their ongoing maintenance in an up to date form after that», and has suggested a phased programme of consolidation, starting with the areas of sexual offences legislation, firearms legislation, employment legislation, family legislation and road traffic legislation, and has recommended the designation of a responsible body to carry out this task\(^{31}\). So far, this has not happened.


\(^{29}\) <http://www.criminalcode.ie>.


IALS Law Reform Project – A LITERATURE REVIEW

Literature review on Law Reform in Ireland

1. Bodies

1.1. Law reform agencies

Articles


1.2. Other relevant bodies

Books


Articles


2. Processes

2.1. Law reform processes

Books

IALS Law Reform Project – A LITERATURE REVIEW

Articles


2.2. Parliamentary procedures

Articles


3. Tools

3.1. Statute law revision

Articles

IALS Law Reform Project – A LITERATURE REVIEW


3.2. Consolidation

Articles


3.3. Restatement

Articles


3.4. Codification

Articles